K.S. to J.M.-A. and J.M.N.
Proposal for publication. July 1982

Further Studies on S.A. Podolinsky

In a recent article in this journal[1] we have called upon S.A. Podolinsky (1850-1891) as a Marxist concerned with energy analysis in agriculture. A West German friend[2] has prepared the following comments "in an attempt (a) to indicate Podolinsky's role in the international socialist as well as in the Ukrainian Russian populist affairs and (b) to mention some of the, by no means insignificant, secondary literature"[2]. We gratefully acknowledge that an urgent demand for juxtaposition and completion of our presentation can thus be met.

J. M.-A., J.M. N.

Podolinsky has never been completely forgotten by his fellow-countrymen. Thus, the 1963 edition of the Ukrainian Soviet Encyclopedia[3] devotes more than a column to "a progressive Ukrainian scholar","a communist political activist", "one of the first propagandists of K. Marx' teachings in the Ukraine". His main publications are quoted and the article is illustrated by a photomechanical reproduction of his letter to Marx from March 18, 1880. Less explicitly Podolinsky already occurs in the 1934 Ukrainian Short Encyclopedia[4]. The Toronto 'concise encyclopedia' Ukraine of 1963/1971 gives a very adequate account of his work including Soviet references.[5] On the other hand, none of the three editions of the Great Soviet Encyclopedia[6] mentions his name.

Two fairly recent monographs rely on archive material[7], such as letters, police reports, as well as on published memoirs of Podolinsky's contemporaries and have thrown light on his work as well as on his interaction with many others who engaged in the struggle for social change: Liudmila I. Korniichuk and Ivan M. Meshko, The Economical Views of S.A. Podolinsky,

Kiev 1958,[8] and Andrei I. Pashuk, Sociological and Sociopolitical Views of S.A. Podolinsky, Lvov 1965.[9] Further references can be found in Populism in the Work of Soviet Scholars 1953-1970, a bibliography published by the Academy of Science USSR[10]. Some autobiographical writings by participants of various leftist student circles, such as the Chaikovsky or the Nechaev group in Petersburg, in 1869, of the populist propaganda movement, 1874-76, the Land and Liberty activities, 1876-78, of the Peoples' Will and Black Partition factions, 1878-81,[11] have been collected in a series of year books, Things that were[12], especially in several volumes which appeared in Petersburg right after 1905, thus forming part of the Social Revolutionary Party's written history. Twenty years later, further material was edited by "The Association of Former Political Prisoners"[13]. A contribution by S. Buda, "For a Biography of S.A.Podolinsky", published in the journal Za sto lit, 1930, seems to be the first biographical attempt.[14] M. Grushevs'kii had included Podolinski in a collection of texts 'From the beginning ...'(14a) and D.M. Bovanenko had just written an article on Podolinsky in the Ukrainian Banner of Marxism, 1928,[15] and his work had also been mentioned every now and then in different contexts, for example in a thesis by Ol. Ogloblin on Ukrainian economic problems treated by scientific and social thinkers of the 19th and 20th century, which was published in part in Red Road, 1928,[16] or in F. Savchenko's monograph, 1930, on The Suppression of the Ukrainian Activities in 1876[17].

In the about 15 years of his politically active life, i.e. from 1867-1882, Podolinsky was connected to people of various camps and projects, in Kiev, Lvov, Vienna, Zurich, Geneva, Paris, London. In Kiev, from 1867-76, radical democrates and socialists created circles, associations, working-groups.[18] N.I. Ziber (1844-1888) was "possibly the first university

teacher of Marxist economy"[19] and a man of great influence as a journalist with the progressive Kiev Telegraf. M.P.Dragomanov (1841-1895) was a "regionalist", a federalist-internationalist, a radical democrate, teaching and writing history, and reanimating Ukrainian culture[20] and Ukrainian alphabetisation, together with Antonovich and Volkov and in the footsteps of the poet Shevchenko, the historian Kostomarov, the ethnographer Kulish, and their "Brotherhood Cyril and Method" (1845-47). In 1873, a Kiev branch of the Imperial Geographic Society was formally chartered. It was headed by the leftist Kiev "Commune" (Gromada), including Ziber and Dragomanov, and soon gained about 200 members. From 1874-76 appeared three volumes of Works[21]. In 1874 the Geographic Society organised an "Archeological Congress" which was a manifestation of the Ukrainian cause, for nationalists and federalists. These activities were interrupted by a Tsarist order, the Bad Ems ukaz, by which, as once already in 1863, the use of written Ukrainian was prohibited.

In Lvov, in the 1870ies, and at first also in a Ruthenian student circle in Vienna (called Sich after the legendary Cossack commune, 16th-18th century), an anti-nationalist secession of the Ruthenian party originated[22], under the influence of Dragomanov and Podolinsky, around the Vienna librarian, the scholar and journalist O. Terletsky (1850-1902), the writer and journalist M.I. Pavlik (1853-1915), and his sister Hanna I. Pavlik (1855-1928), and I.Ia. Franko (1856-1916), the well known Ukrainian writer and poet. In 1877, M. Pavlik and others were arrested and sentenced for having transported illegal printed material to Russia. Shortly afterwards, in January 1878, Terletski, Franko, Kornitskii, Pavlik and others were again sentenced in a spectacular Socialist trial which contributed a lot to popularize socialist ideas in Galicia. In 1878 pamphlets and papers appeared,e.g. Communal

friend, The Bell, The Hammer, Galician-Ukrainian collections, I. Franko: Boa Constrictor (describing the life of the workers)[23].

Zurich had a colony of hundreds of Russians, students of the polytechnical high school, and, including a considerable number of women students, of the university and its faculty of medicine. The politically active part was strong but marked by animosities. P.L. Lavrov (1823-1899) had been a mathematician and philosopher in Petersburg. After being banished in 1866, when the first Land and Liberty movement - which had begun in 1861 with the Emancipation Act - was repressed after the police chief Karakosov had been killed, he wrote Historical Letters[24], the "Evangelic of the youth of the 70ies". When he emigrated to Paris in 1870, he continued to teach a centralist vision of and a gradual transition to socialism. He became the obvious choice for the director of a Russian emigrant journal, since Herzen was dead, Chernyshevsky still in prison, and Bakunin too compromised.

The first number of Forward[25] was produced in 1873. In the same year Zurich was put off-limits to Russians by order of the tsarist government. V N. Smirnov-Idelson (1848-1900), a former Moscow school inspector, acted as a secretary together with N.G. Kuliabko-Koretsky (1846- ?) who, many years later, in 1930, was going to publish Memoirs of a Lavrist[26]. At the end of the 1860ies, while editing The People'sCause[27], the Zurich libertarian socialists, the Bakuninist actionists, had installed a Russian library. Perhaps the friends of the "Alliance" would have tried with less jealousy to keep control of it if they would have known to what extent, later in the 1870ies, Bakunin's ideas (he died in 1876) outdid the Lavrists in popularity. In 1925, M.P. Sazhin-Ross (1845-1934), engineer by formation and a faithful Bakuninist, published Recollections

1860-1880[28]. It was in his house that Podolinsky and Bakunin met. The diary of the latter, reported by M. Nettlau to Grünberg's Archive in 1915,[29] notes a conversation of July 7, 1872, and a month later says: "Podolinsky takes leave". J. Woodcock has given a lively description of the Zurich colony by quoting from Kropotkin.[30]

Towards the end of the 1870ies, Geneva became a "centre of conspiracy", a place where an editor like Elpidine and the "Typography of the 'Worker'"[31] could bring out books, pamphlets, and periodicals supporting the cause: Chernyshevsky, Collected Works; The Worker, 1875-76 (according to A. Thun, a journal of the "Geneva Anarchists"); and pamphlets: The Fed and the Hungry, 1875; The Bashi-Bazuks of St. Petersburg, 1877, etc.[32] The Land and Liberty group had broken up into the more country oriented Black Partition faction, including the later "orthodox Marxists" and Menshevists P. Akselrod, Vera Zasulich, G. Plekhanov, and the Peoples' Will faction, seeking a basis in the towns of Russia and impatiently favouring direct revolutionary action. The latter included Tikhomirov, Morozov, Vera Figner, Olga Liubatovich, Debagory-Mokrievich, Frolenko, and others and maintained an "Executive Committee" in Petersburg. "Community" (Obshchina), the organ of Black Partition, was produced in Geneva, so was the Library of Russian Social Revolutionaries, directed by Lavrov, Morozov, and Hartmann,[33] Since 1877 Dragomanov initiated a publication in Ukrainian language, Gromada, and another socialist periodical Free Word.[34] His political writings are marked by a consciousness and a realistic sense of the limited possibilities of this art.[35]

S.M. Stepniak-Kravchinsky (1851-1895), who in a Land and Liberty action in 1878 in Petersburg had killed the police chief Mezentsev, was living in Geneva or in Clarens, near Montreux, where other Russians and also E. Reclus and

P. Kropotkin had settled. He was to become known as a writer with Underground Russia in 1881, and later on with novels and a comprehensive study on the Russian peasantry.[36] Olga Liubatovich, who was living with Morozov, one of the prominent figures of Peoples' Will, poet and author of The Terrorist Struggle,[37] was an old friend of Podolinsky and was going to publish her recollections More Ancient and More Recent Things[38] in 1905 in Things that were.

Podolinsky's active period is overshadowed by the peasant question and marked by the progressing industrialisation of the Ukrainian sugar production, by the first investments of foreign capital into the new Ukrainian (Donets) exploitation of iron ore, by the rapid growth of the railroad system, by a colonial dependency of the southern provinces form Great Russia. In Podolinsky's lifetime, periods of relative freedom for political activity, 1857-63(66), 1873-76, alternate with repressions, mass arrestations in 1863,66,75, and 81, and show-trials such as the Moscow "Trial of the 193" (who had been arrested in 1874) and the Petersburg "Trial of the 50" in 1877/78, or the "Trial of the 20" in 1882. At the Petersburg trial Sophie Bardina made a lasting impression by a speech "one could put on the lips of a servant of Christ"[39]. She regarded herself a peaceful socialist: "recognising that a violent revolution under certain conditions is an unavoidable evil", as P.Lavrov reported, who considers the speech of P. Alekseev, a simple peasant, "even more striking".[40]

Podolinsky was born into the times when Herzen, Shevchenko, Chernyshevsky, Dobroliubov, Pisarev, and others campaigned with their pens for social change in an agrarian society. When he dies, a small industrial working class begins to take shape and numerous local political groups are going to engage in a long term struggle by corporate organisation. In the beginning of his life, the Crimean War of 1853-56 had rendered the Ancien

Regime untenable. The Emancipation Act of 1861 favoured a type of peasant bourgeois (called mir-eater or kulak) and the administrating aristocrate. It created a peasant proletariat, "people who neither profit even from the smallest piece of land nor have their own hut"[41]. The Austrian constitution of 1861 met the interest of the ruling to control Polish nationalism by reviving the Ukrainian one in Galicia. In Galicia the peasant misery was increased when the legal limitations to subdivision of property were abolished in 1868 together with the limitation for loan interests. After the Polish uprising in 1863, Ukrainian activities in Russia were denounced as disguised Polish seperatism. The Prussian-Austrian war of 1866 gave way to German imperialist ambitions which took on explosive forms with the German-French war of 1870/71. The revolts in Hercegovina in 1874/75 had drawn the attention to the peasant situation under Turkish feudal reign and created loyalty feelings, even among socialists, for the Tsarist administration in the Russian Turkish war of 1876/77. "It should be noted", wrote P. Lavrov "that the coming to the for of the Slavic cause contributed no little to the fatigue in the socialist movement at the end of 1876. Not only that part of the youth which had no firm convictions moved to Hercegovina in crowds, but eventually even some convinced and steadfast socialists".[42] The struggle against Tsarist despotism after the Paris Commune manifested itself by four revolts in Ukrainian towns, led by the railroad factory workers (This industry totalled 1.500 employees at the time). When Vera Zasulich seemingly spontanuously acted against a particular case of a Tsarist oppressor by shooting at Trepov in 1878, this was an overwhelming symbolic action and her acquittal was a triumph. The hopes for revolution culminated and ended with Alexander II being "sent to the other world" by an action of the Peoples' Will in March 1881.

Podolinsky was not a "déclassé" (raznochinets), as Lenin has called the new type of revolutionary of that time; he was an

"even-born". His family owned lands in Yaroslav, near Shpola, a 150 km south of Kiev. When he was born, his father Andrei (1806-1886) gave up his career as a civil servant, head of the provincial post services, with the title of Kammerherr. He was a well known poet of his time and class. The mother was the daughter of a Tsarist officer and land-owner and of a French lady, born Choiseuil-Gouffier.[43] The young Podolinsky, "an attractive appearance" (Kuliabko-Koretski), was thus gifted with an interesting social and financial background. He finished Kiev university as a science candidate and in 1872 went with Ziber via Lvov to Zurich, assists at the Haag (5th) meeting of the First International, goes to see Marx and Engels in London and appears in Alsace, together with Ziber and Kuliabko-Koretski, inspecting workers housing, provided by the Dolfuss company, the cités ouvrières, in Mulhouse.[44] He is heavily engaged in the Forward project with Lavrov (cf. Pashuk) and pursues medical studies in Zurich and Paris. At the Haag metting the gap between authoritarian (Marx, Blanqui) and libertarian socialists shows up and the decline of the First International is confirmed. In Forward, 1874, Podolinsky writes "Sketch of the Development of the International Workers' Association".[45]

In 1874, Podolinsky returns to Kiev, is one of the organizers of the Young Gromada[46], participates in the Geographical Society[47] and the Archeological Congress, and, with the help of Terletsky, starts to publish - anonymously - popularizing socialist pamphlets in Ukrainian language in Vienna: About Agriculture[48], The Truth[49], which is an account of Lassalle's Indirect Taxation and the Situation of the Working Class, both in 1874; The Steam Engine. A Fairy Tale[50], About Poverty[51], which is an account of Marx's The Capital in 1875. In the following year, further pamphlets appear in Geneva: About Richness and Poverty. Tellings of an old landlord[52], About How Our Land Has Become not Ours[53], About the Partition and How One Should

Own the Land[54], the latter in 1877. The Steam Engine, being published in Ukrainian language, was appreciated as 'the first (popular) book accounting for the existence of different nationalities in Russia'. The transcription problem had been solved before by Shevchenko and by Kulish.

In the high times of Propagandist Action of Populism, Podolinsky manages to keep a health station, "being a physician and a pharmacist at the same time", as he describes himself, and some sort of classes for the peasants of his paternal estate, apparently without official permission: "Nobody else would be able to do so", commented one of his friends, stating at the same time that he was not one of those, who in the panslavic rush went to Hercegovina. He also started a training program for nurses in Kiev. Podolinsky had projects for a socialist or social democratic party, adapting Western models. After Dragomanov, it is him who, by his writing and personality, influences the friends in Lvov and makes this group turn socialist-internationalist. I. Franko recalls the satisfaction he felt reading Podolinsky's work and Pavlik started to translate it into Polish.[55] Podolinsky thinks of publishing Ukrainian pamphlets "not in Switzerland or England, but in Rumania or Hungary".

In October 1876 he graduates M.D. from Breslau University with a thesis on "Pancreatic protein fermentation agents"[56]. In 1877 he is married to Maria Andreievna, who comes from a family of land-owners like his own, and belonged to his Kiev medico-political working group. As any open Ukrainian propaganda became impossible in 1876, he emigrated and settled in Montpellier. He had collected statistical material and personal experience for scientific publications on Ukrainian economy and public health. Of Writings of a Southern Socialist[57] a first delivery appears in Geneva in 1877: "The present construction of European society is desintegrating, and in its ruins the elements of the future society are growing and strengthening. This is the obligatory process of historical growth in which the so called social revolutionary movement plays the role of only one of many interacting factors"..."However, there is one general statement beyond any doubt, the land and the means of production will be transferred into common property". And somewhere else: "Not one of the great reform movements came into being without the women. They brought something of their own, something original, into the movement. Very often they mediate the movement, making up for its cultural character (as Maria Magdalena for the first Christians, as the American women...)".

In 1878, a comprehensive study, Life and Health of the People in Ukraine, bears Podolinsky's name on the title page.[58] The subject will be a lasting preoccupation and presumably was supposed to interest the professional community. He gave a talk at a medical conference at Montpellier, on August 27, 1879.(cf. further publications in French in 1881)[59]. This study was reviewed in Jahrbuch für Sozialwissenschaften (L.Richter [Karl Höchberg] ed.)[60] in 1880. Children's mortality in Ukraine amounted to 20 percent and more, compared to 3 percent in all Russia and 2.3 percent in France. 10 to 15 percent or more of the population were considered syphilitics. Podolinsky's propositions are: a doctor for every 10-15 thousand people and a sum of 1.500 to 2.000 rubles for medication per year. In the fall of 1879 "Nihilism in Russia" appears in La Reforme[61], a journal published by the French constitutional socialists. With this article Podolinsky abandons anonymity in his political polemics. An "old Russian socialist" attacks him in Egalité (Guesdes, Lafargue, Liebknecht, Most, Costa, and others are collaborators)[62] on the question of "terrorism" for being arrogant with what he had called "the most militant but less civilised" socialist group (some factions of buntarstva), performing "brainless caprioles". A quotation from Podolinsky's defense in La Revue Socialiste of May 1880[63]: The two elements, political indifference, negation of all principles and the

brainless thrive for material goods constitute the mass of, so to say, organic and constitutional nihilism as described in Dead Souls by Gogol, in Satires by Shchedrin'. However, Bardina and Liubatovich, Nychtrin, Ossinstry, Vittenberg, and Others, far from being without principles, are the most sympathetic martyrs of the social cause. Socialism, sure, is a higher stage of good old nihilism, and he ends by saying, "I cannot object too much to a man of great merits, a man who has been my master, if he diminishes the truth a little to appear more radical".

After the Paris Commune, Benoît Malon, teacher of Jean Jaurès, suffering of Marxophobia (Bernstein), lived in exile in the Jura and in Italy together with the novelist André Leo (her pseudonym) and later on with K. Katkov. In January 1880, he starts an international socialist review, La Revue Socialiste, "which is to be what Revue des deux mondes was for bourgeois literature, Journal des économistes for orthodox political economy, and Revue philosophique for philosophy"[64]. many collaborators are named on the title page: Bebel, Bernstein, Costa, Domela-Neuwenhuis, Guesde , Gnocchi-Viani, Kautsky, Liebknecht, Lafargue, Lavrov, Maria, Politzer, Reclus, Vinas, Theodorovitsch, Vollmer, and others; soon also Podolinsky/Montpellier as well as Dragomanov/Geneva. Podolinsky also collaborates in Costa's Revista internazionale del socialismo, together with Costa's friend Anna Kulishov and some of the people mentioned above. Costa, in July 1879, declared a spectacular "return", away from Bakuninism, in a letter "A miei amici di Romagna", published in La Plebe (cf. below).

1880 is an eventful year: Podolinsky's important study in Ukrainian language, Artisans and Industry in Ukraine[65], appears in Geneva and immediately falls under Russian and Austrian censorship. It became known as the first economic scientific

publication in Ukrainian and as the first history of Ukrainian industry (Ogloblin). In the March number of La Revue socialiste appears his article "Darwinism and Socialism"[66]. According to the Strassburg zoologist Oskar Schmidt, who had given a talk at the Kassel Naturforscherversammlung in 1878, Darwinism was the scientific basis for inequality and thus an argument against radical democracy. Podolinsky replies, following F.A. Lange, that "the other law on mutual sympathy and aid" is not in contradiction with Darwinism. The argument is of course presented with the usual examples from the animal world (as used by Kropotkin as well). "With growing population it is sure that the production of nourishing goods and other means to satisfy our needs, will force men to struggle still more against nature. So it is more advantageous for them to associate in that struggle instead of dividing their forces by constant inside war". Bernstein, in a letter to Engels of May 1882, mentions this work of Podolinsky. According to the editor of this letter[67], Podolinsky's article appeared in Budapest, presumably in German, in 1879. It was going to be published once more in Ukrainian, in Gromada, in 1881.[68]

Podolinsky's attempt to provide scientific data for Marx's theory of economic value (dialectical theory of labour value) by energy considerations was first published in the St. Petersburg liberal periodical The Word, under the title "Human Labour and its Relation to the Distribution of Energy".[69] A second version appeared in La revue socialiste of June 1880, bearing the title "Socialism and the Unity of Physical Forces"[70], a third one in La Plebe, the journal of Gnocchi-Viani, Bignami and the Italian legal socialists, in 1881.[71] Finally, Die Neue Zeit, edited by Kautsky, the inofficial organ of the forbidden German social democratic party, published a fourth version: "Human labour and the Unity of Force (Energy Conservation)"[72]. People like Kuliabko-Koretski, who themselves were interested

in economic questions, appreciated Podolinsky's approach: "in 1880, he placed a very interesting article ... in which he tried to lay the foundation for a new, entirely original theory of labour as an economical category, viewing it under the angle of a natural scientific process". Engels senses a "real discovery".[73] He is right by saying that Podolinsky has not seen correctly the place of his discovery in a dialectical theory of labour value. He is wrong by judging energy accounting in modern economy as too complicated and therefore useless.

Certainly Podolinsky's proposal has not found adequate discussion, certainly in part because the "energy question" was pushed into a completely different line of thought. It was occupied by the rather anti-socialist middle-class ideological battle, starting with A. Dühring's apology of R. Mayer's work and culminating in "energetic models of culture" by Ostwald and others. As a criticism of the latter the absence of concrete energy considerations as part of a new econometry was openly stated - although without any reference to Podolinsky - first not by socialists, but, more or less, in the framework of Sozialökonomik (Max Weber, Franz Oppenheimer, and others).

The publication of "Ukrainian Socialists in Austria", essentially a testimony of the oppression suffered by his friends in Lvov - Pavlik, Anna Pavlik, Franko, Zhenik - may indicate that he was conscious of the consequences of his being their instigator. After the Lvov socialist trial, M. Pavlik came to Geneva and from November 1880 the Gromada will be edited by Dragomanov, Pavlik and Podolinsky. The latter financially supports the journal and the new programme shows his handwriting.[74] Projects for a journal in Roumania, ridiculed by Dragomanov as "higher politics" prove to be unrealistic.

The Gromada work may be seen as a further step towards legalism

and constitutional socialism. Dragomanov reports that, when he first came to Zurich in 1873, he was convinced that the Forward socialist propaganda came too early for Russia, and that one should concentrate on rather more limited aims of political freedom, allowing for more education etc. "A young Kievian, very close to the Forward editor", would in principle agree, but asserted that none of the young people would stay with a non-maximalist journal.[75] The young man may well have been Podolinsky. Times since had changed; however, the old controversy seems to persist. At one stage, Podolinsky proposed the Gromada to be produced in Montpellier, entirely on his account. At first however, Pavlik was going to live in Montpellier and the journal would stay in Geneva. Podolinsky publishes a thorough account of "The Socialist Movement in England and Ireland"[76].

In 1880, the Kievlanin, a conservative paper, had attacked him severely. This may have been a matter of concern for his parents. After the regicide of March 1881, his financial resources at home were apparently blocked. His family life with Andreieva, with a son, born in 1879, and a new born daughter may have become difficult. O. Liubatovich had left her new born daughter with Stepniak-Kravchinski and had gone to Petersburg early in the year, when she learned that Morozov had been arrested. It is said, that Podolinsky was fond of the little Liubatovich and that she was going to be brought up in Montpellier. However, she and Podolinsky's own daughter died in summer 1881, according to Liubatovich, of epidemic meningitis which, according to Kuliabko-Koretski, may have escaped Podolinsky's diagnosis. In the anyhow miserable times after March 1881, this was certainly a lot of mischief at once. Podolinsky fell mentally ill and did not recover until his early death in 1891. He had to undergo psychiatric treatment, first in Montpellier in 1882, later on in Paris. His mother

apparently came to care for him, his father was inspired to write the poem "Mother" and could not stand to stay in Paris himself. By supreme permission the family was able to repatriate the former agitator, who had become inoffensive. A scandal story was told about the son, Sergei jun., about Maria Andreievna and her mother in law. The child was brought up by the latter and became a high civil servant of the Stolypin era.[77]

The last of Podolinsky's writings seems to be "From a Journey to Spain", published in October 1882 in Russian Thinking[78]. "The beauty of the Catalan landscape is of an unusual variety, that is because between the steep and rocky mountains we do not find narrow valleys in the usual sense of the word, but more or less large planes... A young Spanish writer, whom I had got to know in Barcelona, on my remark that Spanish agriculture were superior to the French replied: 'Beware of saying so too early. Spain is a deserted, poor country which, however, has its seam of civilization and richness'." Podolinsky describes at length and with historical data the struggle of the Catalan and Basque people with Spanish centralism. Comparison with his study on England and Ireland in Gromada may reveal the limitations imposed by Tsarist censorship. He stays preoccupied with the question of productivity: "'A Catalan can produce bread even from stones', says a proverb. Nobody who ever saw how wheat is grown even on the rocks, on the smallest bit of ground, high up and surrounded by walls, will object."

Looking at Podolinsky as a case of further study, some of his problems may be recalled: his being the offspring of a privileged class, whose culture, however, is dying. The propaganda for socialism, for armed resistance, buntarstva, with the awareness of the friends risking their lives. The pursuit of scientific education, the thrive for absolute truth and the demand for an utopian complement differing from the clerical hope for salvation. The belief in regional (federalist)

politicization via popular language and the revival of popular traditions, whatever may be understood by these terms.

Some of Podolinsky's problems are of interest, still or again: energy accounting surely is relevant, others of his subjects may be no less so.

Geneva, July 1982.

Footnotes

[1] J. Martinez-Alier and J.M. Naredo, "A Marxist Precursor of Energy Economics: Podolinsky", The Journal of Peasant Studies, 9, 1982, pp. 207-224.

[2] "Please leave my name out. I am too old to appear as a specialist in yet another matter."

[3] Podolins'kii Sergii Andriovich, in: Ukrainska radianska entsiklopediia, Kiiv 1963.

[4] Ukrains'ka zagal'na entsiklopediia, L'viv, Stanislaviv, Kolomiia, s.a. (1933 ?).

[5] Ukraine. A Concise Encyclopedia, published for the Ukrainian National Association, University of Toronto Press 1963, 1970[2] (Vol. 1), 1971 (Vol. 2). Exists also in an Ukrainian edition. The passagesof interest are written by V. Holubnychy.

[6] Bol'shaia Sovetskaia Entsiklopediia, Moskva, 1925-48 (1st edition).

[7] Tsentral'nii gosudarstvennii arkhiv (Oktiabr'skoi revoliutsii deiatelei (TsGAOR), Moskva; Tsentral'nii gosudarstvennii istoricheskii arkhiv (TsGIA), Leningrad; Tsentral'nii derzhavnii istorichnii arkhiv (TsDIA), Kiiv; Tsentral'nii derzhavnii istorichnii arkhiv (TsDIA), L'viv. See also: ***

[8] L.Ia. Korniichuk, I.M. Meshko, Ekonomichni pogliadi S.A. Podolins'kogo, Kiiv 1958 (Vidavnitstvo Akademii Nauk Ukrains'koi RSR).

***K. Studinskii, Galichina i Ukraina v listuvani 1860-1884rr., Khar'kiv-Kiiv 1931; M. Korduba, La littérature historique soviétique-oukrainienne, Warsaw 1938, München 1972.

[9]A. I. Pashuk, Sotsiologichni ta suspil'no-politichni pogliadi S.A. Podolins'kogo, L'viv 1965 (Vidavnitstvo L'vivskogo Universitetu).

[10]Narodnichestvo v rabotakh sovetskikh issledovatelei za 1953-1970 gg.. Ukazatel' literatury, ed. by N.Ia. Kraineva, P.V. Pronina, Moskva 1971 (Akademiia Nauk SSSR. Institut Istorii SSSR).

[11]Zemlia i Volia; Narodnaia Volia; Chernyi Peredel'.

[12]Byloe, London 1900 (No.1) - Paris 1912 (No. 14); No.6-8 appeared in St. Petersburg (6 vols.).

[13]Vsesoiuznoe obshchestvo politicheskikh katorzhan i ssylno-poselentsev.

[14]S. Buda, "Do biografii S.A. Podolins'kogo", Za sto lit, vol. V, 1930.

[15]D.Bovanenko, "Ekonomichna konceptsia Serhia Podolins'kogo", Prapor Marksizmu (Kharkiv) Nr. 2, 1928. See also: O. Miciuk, Ukr. ekonomist Sergii Podolins'kii. zh. Koop. Respublika, Leningrad 1931, which I have not been able to consult.See also:**

[16]Ol. Ogloblin, "Problema ukrains'koi ekonomiki v naukovii i gromads'kii dumtsi XIX-XX v., Chervonii shliakh, No. 9-10, 1928. Ol. Ogloblin has also written A History of Ukrainian Industry (reprint of the 1st edition, 1925), Harvard Series in Ukrainian Studies 1971.

[17]F. Savchenko, Zaborona Ukrainstva 1876 r.(reprint of the Kiev 1930 edition), Harvard Series in Ukrainian Studies, Vol.14, Munich 1970.

[18]A kindergarten for children of workers was organised by Dragomanova, Antonovich and other politically active women.

[19]M.E. Slabchenko, "Introduction" to N.I. Ziber, Ocherki pervobytnoi ekonomicheskoi kul'tury, Gosudarstvennoe izdatel'stvo Ukrainy, 1923.

[20]M. Dragomanov and V.B. Antonovich, Istoricheskiia pesni malorusskogo naroda, (vol. I) Kiev 1874 (k Arkheolog. Kongressu). See also Dragomanov's autobiography in: Byloe, vol. XIII, Paris 1910. and: D.Zaslavskii, M.Dragomanov, Moskva 1934.

[21]Zapiski Iugo-zap. Otd. R. Geogr. Obshch. 1874-76.(2 vols., a third one was going to be published); of interest in this context: Trudy etnograficheskо-statistischeskoi ekspeditsii v zapadno-russkii krai, 1872-1878. For a description of the activities of the society see: B. Dmytryshyn,"Introduction" to F. Sabchenko, op.cit.

***T. Prokopovych,"Fridrikh Engel's pro Ukraiinu", Chervonyi shliakh, No. 7/8, 1927.

[22]"Under the influence of the socialist movement of the Vienna Germans in 1868/69, the working class in Galicia became more active". "The newer socialist movement began in Kiev", wrote B. Limanovski (Jhrb. f. Soz.wiss., L. Richter [i.e. Karl Höchberg] ed., Zürich 1880, vol. I/2); cf. M.T. (Theodorovich ?), ibid.: "The socialist movement of the Galicia Ruthenians started in the 'Academic Circle' (founded at Lvov in 1870) ... an Ukrainian Association for Russian literature, which owned a library and, in 1874, edited an academic journal for Russian literature: Druh ("Friend")".

[23]Gromads'kii Drug (founded by M. Pavlik and his Polish collaborator Boleslav Limanovskii). When this journal was confiscated at the end of 78, Dzwin (The Bell), Molot (The Hammer) took over. Nova vira na Ukraini (The New Faith in Ukraine, The "Shtunda") was a translation of a Russian pamphlet by I Kovalski, Odessa: Rationalism in the South of Russia; 13 other pamphlets appeared in Malaia Biblioteka. Boa constrictor, describing the "Erdwachs" workers condition in Borislaus, was published in the three journals mentioned above.

[24]Istoricheskiia pis'ma first appeared in Nedela; an enlarged version, cf.: P. Lavrov (Mirtov), Istoricheskiia pis'ma, St. Petersburg 1905. For a biography of the author, cf.: Biografiia Petra L. Lavrova, izd. Rabochago znameni 1899 g..

[25]Vpered continued to appear as a periodical in London until 1878.

[26]N.G. Kuliabko-Koretskii, Iz davnikh let. Vospominaniia Lavrista, Izd-vo Politkatorzhan, Moskva 1931.

[27]Narodnoe delo appeared from Sept. 1, 1868, to Sept. 1870 in Geneva (financed by Ol'ga Levashov). "Our program: We demand the full intellectual, social-economic, and political liberation of the people". The journal was welcomed by K. Marx and J.Ph. Becker/Geneva.

[29]M. Nettlau, "Bakunin und die russische revolutionäre Bewegung in den Jahren 1868-1873", in: Archiv für die Geschichte des Sozialismus und der Arbeiterbewegung, hrsg. von Dr. Carl Grünberg, 5. Jg., 3. Heft, S. 357-422, Leipzig 1914.

[28]M.P. Sazhin (Arman Ross), Vospominaniia 1860-1880gg.,(with an introduction by Viach. Polonsky and with a statement of G. Lopatin) Moskva 1925 (on the occasion of the 80th anniversary of the author). In 1865, the author had participated in an illegal edition of Force and Matter by K. Büchner. In 1875, he was "one of those who went to Hercegovina" (p. 9).

[30] J. Woodcock, The Anarchist Prince, London 19..

[31] Tipografiia rabotnika; Imprimerie du "Rabotnik" et de la "Gromada". Rabotnik had originally been the organ of the group of the "Trial of the 50" (Vera Figner et al.). According to P. Axelrod (Jhrb.f.Soz.wiss. II, 1880, p. 261), they were "anarchists but against a buntarstva-terrorism without principles or with the tactis of a Razin, Pugachev etc. of the 17th and 18th century". Cf.: A. Thun, Geschichte der revolutionären Bewegungen in Russland, Leipzig 1883 (the author was a professor in Basel or Freiburg?).

[32] Sitiie i Golodniie, 1875; Iz za reshetki (Poems of prisoners, 1873-77), 1877; Bashi-Bozuky Peterburga, 1877 (Bogoliubov's case; cf. V. Zasulich).

[33] Concerning L. Hartmann, cf. Byloe, No. 3, 1903. He was a teacher from Taganrog, had been politically active in Rostov and, in 1878, together with the sisters Figner, in the Saratov circle. The "Library" comprised, e.g., P. Lavrov, Dekabristy (The Decembrists), G.V. Plekhanov, Chto takoe sotsializm?, K. Marx and F. Engels, The Communist Manifesto.

[34] Vol'noe Slovo, appearing since summer 1881. "Excellent collaborators" (A. Thun, who calls it "the organ of the constitutional socialists").

[35] Cf.: M. Dragomanov, Turki vnutrennie i vneshnie Pis'mo k izdateliu "Novago Vremeni" (H. Georg, Libraire-Editeur), Genève-Bâle-Lyon 1876: "Only a free Russia could liberate the Balcan Slavs". ***

M. Dragomanov, Vnutrennee rabstvo i voina za osvobozhdenie, Genève-Bâle-Lyon 1877.

_____, Listok Gromadi, No. 1, 1878.

_____, "Der Kleinrussische Internationalismus", Jhrb.Sozwiss., I/2, 1880.

_____, La Littérature Oukrainienne proscrite par le Gouvernement Russe. Rapport, presenté au Congrès Littéraire de Paris 1878, Genève 1878.

_____, Le Tyrannicide en Russie et L Action de l Europe Occidentale, Genève 1881.

_____, Istoricheskaia Pol'sha i velikorusskaia demokratiia 1881-12, Paris 1905.

[36] La Russia sotteranea (Treves), Milano 1882; German translation Das Unterirdische Russland, Berlin 1884. Contains biographical essays on Vera Zasulich, Sofi Perovskaia, Jesse Heffmann. The author was the son of a general from Rostov A friend of E. Bernstein; cf. the latter's Aus den Jahren meines Exils, Berlin 1918, recollections written on instigation by R. Schickele. Other works by Stepniak-Kravchinski: The Stundist Pavel Rudenko, Geneva 1900 (a novel about the Stundist movement:

***M.D., "La liberté en Russie", Revue des deux mondes, XIX, 1877.

"the peasant bourgeois is, to use a "Stundist"phrase, the new Pharao who enslaves the people".) Perhaps more important: The Russian Peasantry, London 1905 which includes a historical discussion of sectarianism, of popular religion "A Russian village has never been a mere aggregation of individuals, but a very intimate association, having much work and life in common. These associations are called mirs among the Great and White Russians, hromadas among the Ruthenians".

[37] Vopros terrorizma, Geneva 1880. Cf. Byloe, 12, 1909: "Vozniknovenie 'Narodnoi Voli'", here Morozov and Frolenko give their views on the splitting of Zemlia i vol'ia and on Morozov's separation from Plekhanov, his comrade in the editing board of the journal. Morozov is occasionally considered to be a romantic with an inclination to Jacobinism.

[38] Ol'ga Liubatovich, "Dalekoe i nedavnee", first published in Byloe, 6, 1906, reedited Moscow, 1930 (izd-vo Vsesoiuznogo Obshchestva Politkatorzhan). In his introduction, C.Valk describes her as depending on Morozov in her views and, according to her own definition, guided by a double antithesis: by the opposition of raznochinets and nobleman (dvorianin), herself being one of the latter, and: by the opposition of a medieval knight and a German Lassallian social democrate, the Russian revolutionary being nearer to the former in Liubatovich's imagination.

[39] M.P. Dragomanov, in: Tyrannicide, op. cit.

[40] P. Lavrov, in: Jhrb Sozwiss, II, 1880.

[41] An expression used by Podolinsky.

[42] P.L. Lavrov, loc.cit.

[43] F. Vitberg on A.I. Podolinskii (the father of S.A. P.) in: Russkii biograficheskii slovar', Petersburg 1905: "(Sergei)... caused long years of heavy grief to his parents ... (at Zurich) came under the influence of our revolutionary emigrants, began to change his way of life to one of a simple worker, thereby destroyed his health, married unhappily and fell into uncurable mental illness". Cf.also: S. Kievskii, "Poslednii iz Pushkinskoi pleiady", Russkii Mir, No. 100, 1872; Russkii vestnik, Janvar', 1886.

[44] N.I. Ziber, "El'zas'ki Gromadi", Otech. Zapiski, 1878 g.i 1879/II; cf. Kuliabko-Koretskii, op.cit., who recalls "many happy hours together with Podolinsky, discussing economic and social questions with students full of hope for the future

(Zurich, Platte)" and lovely excursions across the lake to the Polish museum at Rappertswil. During his stay in Zurich, Podolinsky was elected to be in charge of the Zurich library. Podolinsky's remarkable social competence may or may not have been due to his pecuniary potency.

[45] S.A. Podolinsky, "Ocherk razvitiia mezhdunarodnoi assotsiatsii rabotchikh", Vpered, vol. 2, 1874, p.117.

[46] F. Savchenko, op.cit.

[47] Ibid., list of members; date given for Podolinsky: December 5, 1874.

[48] S.A. Podolinsky, Pro Khliborobstvo, Vienna 1875, according to the author (see Sotsialisty Ukraintsy, footnote 73 a): "a popular description of the character of agriculture and the organisation of the peasant community in different countries and in Ukraine, with subsequent presentation of the socialist ideal".

[49] S.A. Podolinsky, Pravda, Vienna 1874.

[50] S.A. Podolinsky, Parova Mashina. Skazka, 1875. Dragomanov commented: "For me, the Steam Engine is not so much a socialist pamphlet as it is petit-bourgeois (à la Gaidamak/17th century), in so far, as it evokes once more the fear of 'buntarstva' - as Shevchenko had done by his works - and of 'khlopomanstvo' ('peasantmania')('My field - my fate!'). One can be surprised that these people (narodovtsi-nationalists), who accepted Shevchenko, are now afraid of the Steam Engine. There is nothing to be afraid of. Only the Ukrainian bourgeoisie may have fears, because the Steam Engine transports ideas which are against their interests and poses the question of the unavoidable abolition of private property of means of production". (Cf.: Korniichuk/Meshko, op.cit.).

[51] S.A. Podolinsky, Pro bidnist', 1875.

[52] S.A. Podolinsky, Pro bogatstvo ta bidnost', Geneva 1876; a Polish translation (presumably by M. Pavlik) under the title Opowiedanie starego gospodarza, according to the author (see below: Sotsialisty Ukraintsy), "was distributed among the peasants in several places: Kossova, Maskalevk, Manastyrsko in Galicia".

[53] S.A. Podolinsky, Iak nasha zemla stala ne nasha. "Popular sketch of the agrarian question in the Ukraine, the history of feudalization of landownership and the loss of regional autonomy" (see below: Sotsialisty Ukraintsy).

[54] S.A. Podolinsky, Iak de zemlia podilenia i iak bi treba ii derzhati, Geneva 1877.

[55] Cf., unpublished manuscript: S.A. Podolinsky and M. Pavlik, Recodzielniectwo i fabriki na Ukrainie, Library of the Academy of Science URSR, Dept. for manuscripts, Lvov.

[56] S.A. Podolinsky, Beiträge zur Kenntnis des pancreatischen Eiweissfermentes, Breslau 1876. The question of Podolinsky's academic teachers in medicine, as well as in his earlier studies in the natural sciences in Kiev, remains to be examined: (Heidenreich, Gräbner)

[57] S.A. Podolinsky, Zapiski iuzhnorusskago sotsialista (vypusk pervyj), Geneva 1877, 32 p.

[58] S.A. Podolinsky, Zhitt'a i zdorovia l'udei na Ukraiini, Geneva 1878, 242 p.

[59] S.A. Podolinsky, Note sur l'ethnographie, la statistique et l'état sanitaire de l'Oukraîne, Extrait du Bulletin de la société Languedocienne de Géographie, Montpellier 1881.
_____, L'état sanitaire des populations du gouvernement de Kiev, Association française pour l'avancement des sciences, 1881.

[60] The review article in question is signed by T.. About the foundation of the Jahrbuch für Sozialwissenschaft und Socialpolitik (2 vols., more have not appeared) and about its founder, Karl Höchberg, son of a Frankfurt banker, about Marx' and Engels' cool and reserved attitude (Engels' disgust at "revolutionary noise" [Revolutionsgeklapper]), cf : Ed. Bernstein, op. cit.. Bernstein eventually published recollections on Dragomanov and Podolinsky; a more precise reference was not availabe. cf. Grushevs'kii op. cit. 14a)

[61] S.A. Podolinsky, "Le Nihilisme en Russie", La Reforme, Oct. 15, 1879 and Nov. 15, 1879. La Reforme: "Politique et sociale, organe des interêts ouvriers. Paraissant le dimanche, Marc-Guyaz, Lyon".

[62] "Le Mouvement Socialiste", Egalité, No.1 and 2, Jan. 1880; Correspondance étrangères: Russie. Letter from Jan. 12, 1880, signed "Un vieux socialiste russe".

[63] S.A. Podolinsky, "Socialisme, Nihilisme, Terrorisme", La Revue Socialiste, No. 6, Mai 1880, p. 304-306.

[64] B. Mâlon, "Programme", La Revue Socialiste, No. 1, Jan. 1880.

[65] S.A. Podolinsky, Remesla i Khvabriki na Ukraiini, Geneva 1880, 147 p.